Rice's Theorem

We never got to doing Rice's theorem this term, but you will find it helpful in doing some of the problems on the practice final and, in general, for understanding part of the reason for the pervasiveness of undecidability.

Definition: $P : \{0,1\}^* \to \{0,1\}$ is a nontrivial property of Turing-acceptable languages if

(1) $P(\langle M \rangle)$ depends only on $L(M)$— if $L(M) = L(M')$ then $P(\langle M \rangle) = P(\langle M' \rangle)$.

(2) P is nontrivial— $\exists M_1$ such that $P(\langle M_1 \rangle) = 1$, and $\exists M_0$ such that $P(\langle M_0 \rangle) = 0$.

If P is a property of Turing-acceptable languages then we say that a language $L = L(M)$ has property P iff $P(\langle M \rangle) = 1$.

Theorem [Rice]: If P is a nontrivial property of Turing-acceptable languages, then

$$L_P = \{\langle M \rangle : \ P(\langle M \rangle) = 1\}$$

is undecidable. (In fact, L_P is not Turing-acceptable if $\emptyset$ has property P; and L_P is not co-Turing-acceptable if $\emptyset$ does not have property P.)

Proof: Case 1. Assume $\emptyset$ does *not* have property P, ie., $P(K_\emptyset) = 0$, where $K_\emptyset$ is a TM for which $L(K_\emptyset) = \emptyset$. We show $A_{\text{TM}} \leq_{\text{m}} L_P$. To show this, we must exhibit a Turing computable function f for which $\langle M' \rangle = f(\langle M, w \rangle)$ is a machine accepting a language with property P iff M accepts w. We specify the behavior of M' on input x to be:

> "Run M on w.
>
> If M rejects, *reject*.
>
> Run K_P on x, where K_P is a (fixed) machine for which $P(\langle K_P \rangle) = 1$. (Here we are using that P is nontrivial).
>
> If K_P accepts, *accept*; if K_P rejects, *reject*."

Clearly M' is Turing computable from M and w. Observe that

(1) if M accepts w then $L(M') = L(K_P)$, which is a language with property P.

(2) if M does not accept w, then $L(M') = \emptyset$ which, by assumption, is a language which does not have property P.

Case 2. Assume $\emptyset$ *does* have property P. Proceed as above, reducing $\overline{A_{\text{TM}}}$ to L_P. □